

CITY OF AURORA
OHIO
Architectural Board of Review
Meeting Minutes
May 26, 2016

The Architectural Board of Review met for a scheduled meeting on Thursday, May 26, 2016 in the Council Chambers at City Hall. Vice Chairman Crystal Lavy called the meeting to order at 6:31 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Present: Lauren Broderick
Melissa Coleman
Crystal Lavy
Absent: Nathan Barrett, Chairman
Also Present: Meredith Davis, Asst. Director Planning, Zoning, Building Division
Marie Lawrie, Clerk

AMENDMENTS TO AGENDA:

MOTION: To add 780 Deepwoods Dr, Addition to the miscellaneous portion of the agenda

Ms. Broderick moved for approval; Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, on a unanimous voice vote.

DECLARATION OF OATH:

Ms. Lavy administered the oath to all those in attendance who wished to speak during the meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

MOTION: To approve the minutes of the April 28, 2016 meeting with addition of the intended house color for the project at 159 N Park Dr.

Ms. Broderick moved for approval; Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried on a unanimous voice vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

OLD BUSINESS:

JOSEPH LUBIN 37 S CHILLICOTHE RD REVISED ADDITION

Joseph Lubin, homeowner was present at the meeting to answer questions. This project was originally approved by Landmark Commission on July 20, 2015 and Architectural Board of Review on July 23, 2015. The revision was approved by Landmark Commission on April 21, 2016. Mr. Lubin explained that he is in need of a second story bedroom for his children. He has now met with several builders and a structural engineer who informed him that it was not a cost effective venture to build the addition over the flat roof. He was seeking permission to tear off the current second story and rebuild it with an 8 foot ceiling. He will match the siding and roof, if possible. If he cannot find a match, he will reside and reroof the structure. He plans new second-story windows and HVAC as well as replacing the electric panel in the home.

MOTION: To approve the revised plans as submitted

Ms. Broderick motioned, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

JND PROPERTIES/STARBUCKS 157 W GARFIELD RD REVISED COMMERCIAL BUILDING

Neil Weinberger, President of JND Properties along with Bob Matakovich of Fabo Architecture attended the meeting. Original plans were approved by Architectural Board of Review on January 28, 2016. Due to a change by Starbucks on the interior layout, the front entry was adjusted and windows were changed. The drive thru was relocated closer to the front.

MOTION: To approve the plans as revised

Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

JOHN LAWRIE 184 N PARK DR ADDITION

John Lawrie, property owner was present at the meeting. He was seeking approval to add 5 feet of width to his attached garage. This project was approved at the Board of Zoning Appeals meeting on April 13, 2016. He plans to install two 7' x 9' garage doors. The added shingles will match the existing roof. Cedar siding will be reused if possible or replaced, and painted to match the house. The homeowner requested that the window on the side elevation changed from offset to center.

MOTION: To approve the plans with the window centered on the side elevation

Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy, Ms. Broderick

Nays: None

GARY ANDERS

1090 W GARFIELD RD

384' SHED

Gary and Lois Anders, property owners were in attendance to answer questions. The Anders' are new to Aurora and were unaware that they would need to have a permit and appear before Architectural Board of Review before having the shed delivered. The location of the shed was approved by the Board of Zoning Appeals on May 17, 2016. The shed is painted to match the residence. The shed features a black metal roof and a front facing overhead door as well as a wide side door and man door. The shed has a front facing overhead door due to the limited mobility on the rear elevation in regards to the pond location. Mr. Anders turned in a letter from their neighbors, Mike & Terri DiStaulo stating that they have no issue with the metal roof. The homeowners stated there are no other neighbors who could easily see this structure. Both the house and shed roofs are black in color, although they are different materials. Landscaping to screen the shed was discussed. The homeowner will submit a landscape plan to be reviewed by the Building Department and the City Arborist.

MOTION: To approve the plans with landscaping to screen the shed to be approved by the Planning, Zoning & Building Department

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

RICHARD BEAUCHAMP

1395 AURORA HUDSON RD

SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE

Richard Beauchamp, property owner was present at the meeting. He was seeking approval to erect a 2,900 square foot, single-story home on his parcel. Stone wraps were reviewed and verified to return appropriately. The gable on the front elevation of the submitted plans that was crossed off will not be built. Shutters are not planned. Windows not installed on stone surfaces will have a 4" wrap. Exposed foundation will be stone to grade to match the front elevation. The unit passed similarity comparison. Colors and materials were presented and noted. The fireplace indicated by floor plans in the great room will not be installed.

MOTION: To approve the plans as submitted

Ms. Coleman moved; Ms. Broderick seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Broderick, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

JIM MARZULLO

290 JACKSON RD

ADDITION

Jim Marzullo, homeowner along with Monty Warren attended the meeting to answer questions. He was seeking approval to construct a 704 square foot detached garage within the Andrew Jackson Estates. This 22' x 32' structure will feature carriage garage doors, a single man door, a set of double doors and windows on three elevations. The foundation is stated as parged block. The front facing overhead door will be accepted as a hardship situation due to the topographical issues of the lot, as well as the cul-de-sac location with minimal traffic. The colors and materials will match the home.

MOTION: To approve the plans as submitted

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

KURT DAVIS

142 ELDRIDGE RD

ADDITION

Stephanie Davis, homeowner along with Steve Ciciretto, architect were on hand to explain the project. They were seeking approval to add a 192 square foot addition to their house within the Aurora Land Co subdivision. There is a vacant lot behind the home and the addition will not be visible from the street. The second story addition will be added over the flat roof on the rear elevation. The gable will give the project some aesthetic appeal.

MOTION: To approve the plans as submitted

Ms. Coleman moved, Ms. Lavy seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy, Ms. Broderick

Nays: None

CLASSIC HOMES

750 E HOMESTEAD DR S/L 107

SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE

Ed Wurm Jr., of Classic Homes was present at the meeting. He was seeking approval to erect a 4,340 square foot, two-story residence within the Homestead subdivision. This home features rolled aluminum wrapped dormers, a 3 car garage, and a direct vent fireplace. This unit passed the similarity comparison. The home will not have shutters. All wraps appeared appropriate. Colors and materials were presented and noted.

MOTION: To approve the plans as submitted

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

CLASSIC HOMES

310 SHADY GROVE S/L 48

SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE

Ed Wurm Jr., of Classic Homes was in attendance to represent a second project. He was seeking approval to construct a 3,008 square foot, two-story residence within the Homestead Subdivision. This home features a covered porch, a 3 car garage, and a rear elevation direct vent fireplace. There was discussion pertaining to the large, front elevation window. It was determined that this window is an architectural feature and not a bay window. Finishes and building material samples were presented and noted. This unit passed the similarity comparison.

MOTION: To approve the plans as submitted

Ms. Coleman moved, Ms. Broderick seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Broderick, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

CLASSIC HOMES

845 E HOMESTEAD DR S/L 89

SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE

Ed Wurm Jr., of Classic Homes presented a third project. He was seeking approval to erect a 2,845 square foot, two-story residence within the Homestead subdivision. Ed Wurm Sr. appeared before the Board on a preliminary basis on January 28, 2016 for feedback on this elevation based on the driveway configuration, garage location, and fireplace location. This home features a front loading garage at an angle, and a side elevation fireplace which is hidden by the garage, and a circular driveway. The unit passed the similarity comparison. Stone wraps were verified with the builder. Finishes were presented and noted.

MOTION: To approve the plans as submitted

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES

504 SHEFFIELD CT S/L 37

CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, of Ryan Homes was on hand to answer questions, along with Mike Seliga. They were seeking approval to erect a 4,154 square foot, single-story, elevation B Brentwood model condo within the Sheffield Estates subdivision of The Lakes of Aurora. This unit features a rear elevation sunroom and direct vent fireplace. The unit has a front-loading garage. There was discussion pertaining to shutters, and the stone wraps. Notations were made on the plans to verify a 2 foot full height stone return on the front elevation bedroom #2, which then converts to watertable height stone return to the porch corner. This condo passed the similarity comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Sandy Tan siding and Bucks County Stone.

MOTION: To approve the plans with the noted stone wraps and the elimination of the right side elevation shutters

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Lavy seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Lavy, Ms. Coleman

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES

523 SHEFFIELD CT S/L 8

CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, Project Manager for Ryan Homes along with Mike Seliga presented a second project for the Sheffield Estates in the Lakes of Aurora. They were seeking approval to construct a 4,154 square foot, single-story, elevation B Brentwood model condo. This unit features a side-loading garage, a rear elevation sun room and direct vent fireplace. There was discussion pertaining to shutters, windows, and the stone/brick wraps. Notations were made on the plans to remove the left and right side elevation shutters and adding 4 inch wrap to the windows. Notations were made on the plans to verify a 2 foot full height stone return on the front elevation bedroom #2, which then converts to watertable height stone return to the porch corner. This condo passed the similarity comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Irish Thistle siding and Connestoga Ledgestone.

MOTION: To approve the plans with the removal of side elevation shutters and addition of 4 inch wrap to the same windows as well as the noted stone wraps

Ms. Coleman moved, Ms. Lavy seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy, Ms. Broderick

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES

535 SHEFFIELD CT S/L 5

CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, Project Manager for Ryan Homes along with Mike Seliga presented a third project for the Sheffield Estates in the Lakes of Aurora. They were seeking approval to construct a 3,499 square foot, single-story, elevation B Pisa Torre model condo. This unit features a front-loading garage, a rear elevation morning room, direct vent fireplace and a walk-out basement. There was discussion pertaining to shutters, windows, and the stone/brick wraps. Notations were made on the plans to remove the side elevation shutters and adding 4 inch wrap to the windows. This condo features shutters on the front elevation double window. This will remain as a decorative architectural feature. This unit has a front door with a single side light due to the location of a closet in the foyer. This condo passed the similarity comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Flint siding and Sierra Ledgestone.

MOTION: To approve the plans with deletion of the side elevation shutters

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES 520 SHEFFIELD CT S/L 41 CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, Project Manager for Ryan Homes along with Mike Seliga presented a fourth project for the Sheffield Estates in the Lakes of Aurora. They were seeking approval to construct a 3,898 square foot, single-story, elevation A Brentwood model condo. This unit features a front-loading garage. There is no fireplace planned for this unit. There was discussion pertaining to shutters, windows, and the stone/brick wraps. Notations were made on the plans to remove the side elevation shutters and adding 4 inch wrap to the windows. This condo passed the similarity comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Flint siding and Bucks County stone.

MOTION: To approve the plans with deletion of the side elevation shutters

Ms. Coleman moved, Ms. Broderick seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Broderick, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES 737 HILLIARY LN S/L 37 CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, Project Manager for Ryan Homes along with Mike Seliga presented a project for the Villas of Bertram. They were seeking approval to construct a 3,918 square foot, two-story, elevation B Venice model condo. This unit features a front-loading garage, a rear elevation morning room, and direct vent fireplace. There was discussion pertaining to shutters, windows, and the stone/brick wraps. This condo features shutters on the front elevation. This project passed the similarity comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Flint siding and Dakota Ledge stone.

MOTION: To approve the plans with a rear elevation direct vent fireplace

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES 721 HILLIARY LN S/L 41 CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, Project Manager for Ryan Homes along with Mike Seliga presented a second project for the Villas of Bertram. They were seeking approval to construct a 3,598 square foot, two-story, elevation B Venice model condo. This unit features a front-loading garage. There is no fireplace planned for this

unit. There was discussion pertaining to shutters, windows, and the stone/brick wraps. Stone was added to the front of the garage at water table height. It will wrap to the front door on the left and a 2 foot wrap on the right at of the garage. This condo features shutters on the front and side elevations. This project passed the similarity comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Irish Thistle siding and Autumn Buckeye stone.

MOTION: To approve the plans with the garage elevation stone and wraps noted

Ms. Coleman moved, Ms. Lavy seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy, Ms. Broderick

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES

745 HILLIARY LN S/L 35

CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, Project Manager for Ryan Homes along with Mike Seliga presented a third project for the Villas of Bertram. They were seeking approval to construct a 3,918 square foot, two-story, elevation C Venice model condo. This unit features a front-loading garage and a rear elevation morning room and direct vent fireplace. This unit also features a walk-out basement. Shutters, windows, and the stone/brick wraps were reviewed. There are no shutters planned for this unit. Stone was added to the front of the garage at water table height. It will wrap to the front door on the left and a 2 foot wrap on the right at of the garage. This project passed the similarity comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Sandy Tan siding and Dakota Ledgestone.

MOTION: To approve the plans with the garage elevation stone and wraps noted

Ms. Coleman moved, Ms. Lavy seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy, Ms. Broderick

Nays: None

RYAN HOMES

90 SAMANTHA DR S/L 61

CONDO

Phil Wendzicki, Project Manager for Ryan Homes along with Mike Seliga presented a fourth project for the Villas of Bertram. They were seeking approval to construct a 3,646 square foot, two-story, elevation B Florence model condo. This unit features a front-loading garage and a rear elevation morning room. There is no fireplace planned for this unit. Shutters, windows, and the stone/brick wraps were reviewed. Stone was shown on the front of the garage at water table height. It will wrap to the front door on the left and a 2 foot wrap on the right at of the garage. This condo features shutters on the front and the left elevation operable windows. There are shutters on the right elevation with the exception of the morning room double windows. This project did NOT pass the similarity comparison. A discussion ensued advising the builder to inform the purchaser that this unit is too similar to a neighboring property. A change to siding color or stone might help this home pass the comparison. Finishes were presented and noted on the plans including Silver Mist siding and Bucks County stone.

MOTION: To approve the plans contingent on a second review of finishes for similarity comparison – APPROVAL PENDING

Ms. Broderick moved, Ms. Coleman seconded, and the motion carried, 3-0, on a roll call vote.

Yeas: Ms. Broderick, Ms. Coleman, Ms. Lavy

Nays: None

MISCELLANEOUS:

 780 Deepwoods Drive

This project was approved with the addition of a gable to the front elevation. During discussion at the meeting, it was implied that the front elevation gable would match the design of the rear elevation gable which bumps out. However, the motion made at the meeting did not specify this style of gable. Ms. Davis explained that to enforce the approvals made by the Architectural Board of Review, motions need to be more specific. The motion specified adding a gable, but not the exact style of the gable. The builder was contacted by the Building Department and agreed to discuss the bump out style gable with the homeowners.

Going forward the Board will be more specific with their motions. The object of the Board is not to hold up a project. With this in mind an approval may be contingent on specific changes. These changes may be drawn in at the meeting, a revision may be required, or the project could be tabled until the next month.

ADJOURNMENT:

Ms. Lavy moved; Ms. Broderick seconded, and the meeting adjourned at 10:01 p.m. on a unanimous voice vote.

Crystal Lavy, Vice Chairman

Marie Lawrie, Secretary